Moral Development and Moral Education: An Integrated Approach

Hing-keung Ma

Department of Education Studies

Hong Kong Baptist University

In this paper an overview of the psychological concepts of morality is presented and the aims of moral education based on these concepts are delineated in details. The affective and cognitive aspects of moral development are integrated in the construction of a holistic moral education program for primary school, secondary school and university students. Four domains of moral education are proposed as follows: human relationships and altruism, moral feeling and psychological needs, moral judgment, and citizenship. In addition, there are ten primary moral characters that we need to help children to develop. These moral characters are: (1) Humanity, (2) Intelligence, (3) Courage, (4) Conscience, (5) Autonomy, (6) Respect, (7) Responsibility, (8) Naturalness, (9) Loyalty, and (10) Humility. Chinese and Western perspectives are employed to elaborate the details of the proposed moral education program as well as the features of the ten primary moral characters. It is claimed that the proposed moral education program and the ten primary moral characters are universal for all cultures.

Key words: moral development, moral education, moral character

---

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Hing-keung Ma, Department of Education Studies, Hong Kong Baptist University, Kowloon Tong, Kowloon, Hong Kong. E-mail: hkma@hkbu.edu.hk

Chinese people place great emphasis on educating their children to be responsible, polite, prosocial and helpful (Ho, 1986; Ma, 1988). Educators in Chinese societies regard moral education as most important. But it seems that the practice of moral education in Hong Kong, Mainland China and Taiwan is only fairly satisfactory. For example, there are few structural and evidence-based moral education curriculum materials in these three places (Ho & Ho, 2004; Lee, 2004; Lu & Gao, 2004; Shek & Ma, 2006). An overview of the moral education research in Hong Kong, Mainland China and Taiwan is presented first. Then some essential concepts of morality and moral education as well as the major issues on moral education are discussed. The major part of this paper is to delineate a theoretical proposal for curriculum development in moral education. The affective and cognitive aspects of moral development (Ma, 1982, 1992, 1997, 1998) will be integrated in the detailed discussion of the major aspects of moral education. In addition, ten primary moral characters are proposed for teaching purposes.

Moral Education Research in Chinese Societies

A review of moral education research, especially the development and construction of moral education curriculum programs in Hong Kong is presented in details below. A brief description of the moral education curriculum research in Mainland China and Taiwan is also given at the end of this section.

Moral Education in Hong Kong

There is no formal moral education curriculum in Hong Kong primary or secondary schools. The teaching of moral education is tied with Religious Studies, Social Studies, Humanities and other subjects. In fact, informal teaching of moral education in school assembly, form teacher class, and whole-school activities is quite common in Hong Kong. There are several development or education programs that focus on moral education, civic education, life education and ethics education in Hong Kong. A few examples are outlined below.

Ethics and Religious Studies

In Hong Kong, there are quite a large number of primary and secondary schools that are being run by religious organizations. One form of moral education in these schools is implemented through the teaching of Ethics and Religious Studies. For example, Xu (1984) has written a series of books on Ethics Education for use in Catholic secondary schools in Hong Kong. These books deal with topics on youth development and human relationships and attempts to integrate the Chinese values and whole-person education into religious studies. The teaching of Ethics and Religious Studies in Christian schools and Buddhist schools is also common (Education Bureau, 2007).

Life and Ethics Education

The construction of moral education curriculum materials is quite well-supported by Quality Education Fund (QEF). Recently they have selected ten Life Education Projects as outstanding projects and the majority of these projects have included teaching packages on topics such as resilience, anti-bullying, life and death education, and ethics education (Quality Education Fund, 2007). The details of one of these projects, *Life and Ethics Education Program for Junior Primary and Junior Secondary School Students*, are highlighted below because of its comprehensive scope.

This study attempts to develop an all-round education package on life and moral education for junior primary (P.1 to P.3) and junior secondary (F.1 to F.3) school students in Hong Kong. A series of twenty education programs per grade level that aims at fostering the life and moral and social development of students were designed. Each program will last for one class period (35–40 minutes).

There are three basic education objectives in the construction of the education programs. First, the whole curriculum package aims at fostering the all-round or whole-person development in students. The coverage of the package is wide and comprehensive and includes the major aspects of development. Second, the teaching and learning of the programs should be a happy and stimulating process. It emphasizes a happy interactive environment in which the students will be able to produce a lot of creative and interesting ideas. Third, the end result of running these programs is to produce acceptable and positive developmental outcome. In other words, students should develop a more advanced or mature stage of psychological

development towards the completion of the whole program teaching. Eight domains of education are covered: moral, intellectual, physical, social, aesthetic, sex, emotion and environmental education. The following is a brief description of the main emphases of the education programs on these eight domains:

- Programs for moral education emphases on fostering honesty, rule and law-abiding orientation and justice judgment.
- Programs for intellectual education focuses on learning skills and creative thinking.
- Programs for physical education focuses on physical development, the meaning of life, aging, sickness and death.
- Programs for social education deal with issues relating to human relationships, and national and racial identity.
- Programs for aesthetic education focus on cultivating an ability to appreciate beauty in daily life.
- Programs for sex education focus on sex difference, sex-role development, and sexuality and love.
- Programs for emotion education attempt to teach students skills to cope with stress, facing unpleasant interaction and overcoming difficulties in daily life.
- Programs for nature (environment) education emphasize on helping students to understand and appreciate the beauty of nature.

In this study, effectiveness of teaching methods was investigated by asking the students and teachers to fill in the Program Evaluation Questionnaire. The data indicated the programs are in general positively evaluated by students and teachers (Ma, Tam, & Wong, 2001a, 2001b).

Positive Youth Development Programs

There are several programs that focus on positive youth development. Understanding the Adolescent Project (UAP, 2003) and Adolescent Health Project (2004) are two of the examples. The UAP focuses on resilience and aims to reduce the negative behaviors of junior secondary adolescents who are identified as having high psychosocial needs. On the other hand, Adolescent Health Project is a universal program to help junior secondary students understand and accept themselves. It covers topics on sex and love, interpersonal relationships, creative and critical thinking, coping with stress, and physical health.

Recently a large-scale project called P.A.T.H.S. (Positive Adolescent Training through Holistic Social Programs) (Shek & Ma, 2005–2008) was implemented. This project involves researchers from five local universities and a total of 120 education programs for junior secondary school students were constructed. Each program takes 35 to 40 minutes to complete. The package is being used by more than 200 secondary schools in Hong Kong. There are five major features of the program.

1. Strong Theoretical Underpinnings: The program will be constructed based on Catalano, Berglund, Ryan, Lonczak, and Hawkins's (2002) 15 positive youth development constructs, which cover the major aspects of youth development. It will also cover the gender and cultural issues in development as far as possible.

2. All-round Development and Whole-person Education: The program will deal with the all-round development of adolescents. It will cover several ecological domains and current youth issues.

3. Professional Training for Teachers and Social Workers: All teachers and social workers participating in the teaching of the program will undergo a three-day training course (a total of 20 teaching hours).

4. Flexible Teaching Schedule and Combination of Units: The program will consist of 40 units per grade (i.e., the Full Program), 20 of which will belong to the Core Program. Schools will be allowed to run one or more units per week so long as they complete the program in one academic year.

5. Rigorous Quality Assurance of Program Product: The program will be evaluated by a longitudinal intervention study. In addition, a rigorous quality assurance process will be conducted to make sure that each program unit is suitable for use in all secondary schools in Hong Kong. In other words, the quality of the program will be evidence-based.

The whole project contributes significantly to the fields of youth development, whole-person education, and life and moral education. The original teaching package was produced in Chinese and the research team is currently producing an English version for use in Hong Kong and other places.

Education for Integrity (or Anti-Corruption Education)

The Education Division of the Hong Kong Government's ICAC (Independent Commission Against Corruption, 2005) has developed and

constructed a series of Moral Education Programs for primary and secondary schools students. The program covers topics on money, justice, anti-corruption, and prosocial behavior. The focus of the program is clearly spelt out and the construction is well above the standard of the curriculum materials in Hong Kong. The impact of this program on moral education is significant and profound. It is well received by school teachers and educators in Hong Kong.

Liberal Studies

While there is no formal curriculum on moral education in Hong Kong, there are several subjects in which substantial part of the contents are related to moral and civic education. Liberal Studies, Social or General Studies, and Integrated Humanities are some of these subjects. Take for example, the senior-secondary Liberal Studies, which is a core subject in the three-year senior secondary curriculum instituted in September 2009. This curriculum is comprised of three areas of learning: "Self and Personal Development", "Society and Culture" and "Science, Technology and the Environment. It also includes six modules: (1) Personal Development and Interpersonal Relationships, (2) Hong Kong Today, (3) Modern China, (4) Globalization, (5) Public Health, and (6) Energy Technology and the Environment. It is obvious that a number of key moral issues related to interpersonal conflicts, world trading, public health and environmental protection as well as major issues on citizenship will be dealt with in the teaching of this subject (Shek, Ma, & Sun, 2008).

In addition, the Education Bureau (formerly called Education Department) has compiled and published a series of reference materials on moral and civic education (Education Department, 1982–1993). These materials include curriculum materials developed by school teachers and university researchers as well as discussion papers on various issues concerning moral and civic education.

Moral Education in Mainland China

In recent years, there have been a lot of teaching packages and textbooks on mental or psychological health for primary and secondary schools students in Mainland China (Fang & Fang, 1999; Wo, 1998a, 1998b; Zhang & Wang, 2002). The changes from politically oriented moral education to individual

well-being, psychological health and whole-person development are well delineated by Lee and Ho (2005). The contents of these packages cover the major aspects of youth development. For example, the major contents of Wo's (1998a, 1998b) series of textbooks for primary and secondary school students include self-consciousness, self-esteem, self-confidence, learning strategies, memory, thinking, emotion, affection, interpersonal interaction and value concepts. The construction of the curriculum is innovative, systematic, practical and based on updated reference materials (Lin, 1998, p.ii). In general, life and moral education in Mainland China tends to emphasize holistic psychological development and daily life events (Lu & Gao, 2004). The teaching packages on mental health or life and moral education were usually developed and constructed by well-experienced psychologists, educators, and teachers.

Moral Education in Taiwan

On the other hand, there is a series of moral and civic education textbooks used by junior and senior secondary schools in Taiwan (National Institute of Compilation and Translation, 1994, 1995). The four major components of this curriculum include the knowledge, morality, and activities of a citizen as well as norm for daily life. There are six textbooks for junior secondary school and the topics include: (1) Complete Education, (2) Harmonious Society, (3) Fair Laws, (4) Democratic Politics, (5) Growing Economy, and (6) Inclusive Culture. Similarly, there are four textbooks for senior secondary school and the topics include: (1) Psychology and Education, (2) Morality and Culture, (3) Law and Politics, and (4) Economics and Society. In general, the contents focus more on citizenship, morality, history, economics, law, politics, culture, education, social structure, and humanities. Recently, an educational reform was implemented in 2004, and explicit moral and civic education in Taiwan secondary schools is no longer in practice (Lee, 2004). It is likely that more diversified life and moral education that includes different aspects of youth development will be implemented in the near future.

Concepts of Morality and Moral Education

The study of morality has long been a most important topic in philosophy. However, the systematic study of moral development in psychology only

started in the past few decades, with rapid improvements in the past thirty years or so. In some sense, moral psychology is only in its stage of childhood at the present time. In the following paragraphs, some psychological concepts of morality are discussed briefly and Durkheim's sociological concept of morality is also included here because of its great impact on moral studies.

Some Common Concepts of Morality

Psychoanalysts tend to define morality as a force that is negative to life and love; a force that causes mental illness and death. Gilligan (1976) defines morality as "action and thought motivated by a sense of compulsion or obligation rather than by love (spontaneous inclination or wish), and by a negative wish to avoid painful feelings (shame or guilt) rather than by a positive wish to express feelings of love" (p. 145).

Behaviourists tend to link morality with social conditioning or social conformity. Eysenck (1976) defines conscience as a "conditioned reflex" in his biological explanation of morality. He argues that: "by calling a variety of actions bad, evil, or naughty, we encourage the child to identify them all in one category, and to react in the future with anxiety to everything thus labeled" (Eysenck, 1976, p. 109).

The concept of morality in the Cognitive Developmental Approach is elaborated in detail by Kohlberg (1969, 1971, 1981). Basically speaking, the concept (Principle of Universal Justice) is constructed on Kant's moral philosophy and Rawl's (1999) theory of justice.

Morality can also be defined in terms of altruism and social norms or moral rules. Wright (1971) writes: "moral rules are foundational in the sense that they are concerned with the maintenance of, for instance, trust, mutual help and justice in human relationship. .... Moral rules form the yardstick against which we evaluate the rules of any particular activity" (p. 13). It follows that "moral behavior consists of all the various things people do in connection with moral rules" (p. 15).

Durkheim (1925) argues that there are three elements of morality: (1) discipline—a spirit shared generally by members of the group, (2) attachment to those social groups of which one is a member, and (3) autonomy or self-determination. He elaborates the last element as follows: "We must have knowledge, as clear and complete as awareness as possible of the reasons for our conduct. This consciousness confers on our behavior the autonomy that the public conscience from now on requires of

every genuinely and completely moral being" (Durkheim, 1925, p. 120). In other words, such moral behavior "must be freely desired, that is to say, freely accepted" (p. 120).

Aims and Objectives of Moral Education

According to the concepts of morality delineated above, there are five aims of moral education.

1. According to the psychoanalytic concept of morality, morality is something that would give despair, depression and negative emotion. The aim of moral education is to teach children a life style free from shame and guilt as far as possible. This can only be achieved by helping the children to develop a true moral conscience and an attitude to try your best in resolving a moral dilemma and then accept the consequence. The true moral conscience refers to a kind-hearted disposition with a genuine humanity, profound empathy and broad-minded forgiveness.

2. The social conditioning in the Behavioral concept of morality would mean that we should help the children to adapt to the adult's values that are commonly practiced in their society. The negative side of this definition is that if the adult's morality is a corrupted or negative one, then we are teaching the next generation to be immoral rather than moral. While this concept is powerful in shaping the moral behavior of the children, its negative effect should not be undermined.

3. The cognitive developmental concept of morality emphasizes on perspective of role-taking and universal principles of justice. The aim of moral education is to foster the development of critical, independent and innovative moral thinking. Children should also be taught to argue the moral issue in authentic contexts from different perspectives. People should act rationally, consistently, calmly and fairly in emotionally aroused situations that have a moral implication.

4. The emphasis on altruism and moral rules implies that the aim of moral education is to teach children to be altruistic, empathetic, caring and compliant to social rules and norms in the society. As far as altruism is concerned, children should be taught to extend their love and sacrifices to their parents and significant others to include acquaintances, neighbors, strangers in one's country and people in other countries (Ma, 1992, 1997, 2003). As for the moral rules, children should be taught to be compliant to the social rules and social norms in one's society.

Criticism and challenges to these moral rules should be carried out by rational, legitimate and peaceful methods as far as possible.

5. According to Durkheim's concept of morality, we should teach children to be a self-disciplined and autonomous member of the society with a clear and committed identity to one's society and nation. The idea of discipline of a group is related to the social conformity in the Behavioral concept and the moral rules in Wright's definition of morality.

It should be noted that the concept of autonomy is a key value in Western cultures. Many psychologists and educators (Bull, 1969; Kohlberg, 1981, 1984; Rest, 1986) regard personal autonomy as an important characteristic of the highest stage of moral judgment. Norman Bull (1969) argues that personal autonomy "alone is wholly adequate in a democratic and increasingly permissive society. It follows that autonomy must be the true goal of moral education" (p. 121). According to Bull (1969), there are three enemies of personal autonomy: (a) authoritarianism, (b) physical discipline, and (c) indoctrination. In other words, these three enemies should be eliminated or conquered if the true goal of moral education is pursued. In addition, children should be taught to be critical of the possible defects of the existing moral system in our society and should be able to challenge the status quo rationally, logically and independently (Giroux, 1983).

The basis of moral education is not to teach children a lot of moral contents, but instead to help the children to learn the principles of morality. John Wilson (1967) emphasizes on helping children to learn and develop the moral principles or rules to judge and make decisions. He argues that any basis for moral education "should consist of imparting those skills which are necessary to make good or reasonable moral decisions and to act on them. We are not primarily out to impart any specific <u>content</u> but to give other people facility in a <u>method</u>" (p. 27).

Limits of Moral Education

Unlike the teaching of academic subjects such as physics, chemistry, mathematics and history which have clear syllabus or subject contents, the task of moral education is less defined and less explicit. "'Moral Education" is a name for nothing clear. Yet, morality and education are two things which everybody has, or has undergone, and about which most people hold

strong views of their own" (Wilson, 1967, p. 11). Duncan (1979) argues that because of this unclear understanding of the task of moral education, "the greatest temptation to seek an escape from moral thinking arises in the field of moral education" (p. 15). Teachers of subjects such as literature, history, integrated science and EPA (Economics and Public Affairs) which unavoidably involve some important moral issues often receive no proper and systematic training in moral thinking.

Moral Development and Moral Education

A number of psychological theories of moral development will be used as a basis for the proposed model of moral education. For examples, Piaget's (1932) Theory of Moral Judgment for Children; Kohlberg's (1981, 1984) Theory of Moral Judgment Development; Maslow's (1987) Theory of Human Motivation and Ma's (1992, 1997) Theory of Moral Development for the Chinese People. The structures of the moral education curriculum for the following four education levels: EL1 (Education Level 1) = approximately kindergarten to junior primary school level; EL2 = approximately senior primary school level to junior secondary school level; EL3 = approximately senior secondary to post-secondary school level; EL4 = approximately undergraduate to postgraduate level are proposed.

Education Level 1

Human Relationship and Altruism: Family, Significant Others and Filial Piety

Children at this stage are in general egoistic and selfish. They have deep and profound attachment to their parents and usually act altruistically in order to please their parents or authorities. Small-I refers to oneself and Big-I refers to the majority or the social group or society. Small-I egoism means that the person only cares for himself or herself and ignores the interests of others, especially the interest of the social group or society (i.e., the Big-I) that he or she is affiliating. Children at this stage show deep attachment and profound love toward significant others. They are willing to save significant others' lives because of their deep love toward them.

The teaching of children at this education level should focus on filial piety. The development of a positive and pleasant relationship between the

child and his/her parents, siblings, grandparents and other family members is another major educational concern at this level. The deep and profound love between family members and the idea of home — sweet home — should be emphasized.

Moral Feeling and Psychological Needs: Secure Feeling and Basic Trust

People at this stage would argue that it is right to be egocentric and selfish for the sake of physical survival. What is right is to do things that would favor their gratification of survival and safety needs, very often at the expense of others. In other words, they tend to place more emphasis on materialistic and lower needs rather than spiritual and higher needs. In short, they tend to be very selfish and egocentric. The struggle for food, water, sexual satisfaction and materialistic awards is their major concern. They would act by all means to get what they want or to satisfy their physiological and safety needs. On the other hand, they are quite fear of being physically hurt or physically punished.

The major educational task at this level is therefore on fostering the development of a secure attachment and basic trust with parents and other family members so that the children can grow up with security and are free from fear.

Moral Judgment: Compliance, Reciprocity and Instrumental Purpose

Children at this stage obey blindly what the authority commands in order to avoid punishment. They often find difficulty in understanding differences in points of view between themselves and others. In other words, they are not aware of other's reasoning from a third-person perspective. They also confuse the authority's perspective with their own (Kohlberg, 1976, p. 34). Children at this stage regard rules, social norm, traditional values, and common practices as rigid and unchangeable guidelines for their behaviors. What is right is to comply as closely as possible with social norms and practices.

In order to survive, the elder children will exchange with others something that is important to them, for examples, their properties and their power. Survival is negotiated based on instrumental purpose.

Acts are usually regarded as instrumental means to serve one's needs and interests. For instance, children at this stage tend to help others who are

in desperate situations because they expect others to do the same for them some day. On the other hand, if the situation does not clearly indicate that such help would bring them more benefits than cost to the actor in the long run, then the actor would stick to the rule "mind your own business" or "let things drift if they do not affect one personally", and would not act to help the victims. The contents of the exchange or the deal are often concrete or materialistic things such as money or food, or things which are perceived as good to serve one's own needs or interests such as praise from authorities. The perspective of judgment is individualistic; self-interests precede group or others' interests. It should be noted that things that are too general or abstract such as basic rights of human beings are seldom considered or valued in the exchange or deal.

Moral education at this level should pay more attention to the development of reciprocity and instrumental purpose in daily life events such as cooperation, mutual help and mutual respect.

Citizenship: Discipline and Group Rules

The compliance to social norms, propriety and common practices is based on instrumental purpose and equal exchange. For example, keeping promise is a kind of propriety or a norm in a society. But one would think that it is right not to keep a promise to a person who has not kept a promise to him or her in the past. If anyone does not comply with the norm, people at this stage would think that it is right to revenge or retaliate.

As Durkheim (1925) pointed out, discipline and group affiliation are two important elements of morality. Children must learn to discipline themselves and to respect for and comply with group rules at this level.

Education Level 2

Human Relationship and Altruism: Friendships and Primary Group Altruism

People at this stage care about the survival of the primary group (e.g., family, religious or political parties) more than themselves. They are willing to sacrifice their lives for the primary group if necessary. They are more altruistic to members of their primary group than to out-group members. The Hierarchy of Human Relationships (kin–good friends–strangers) is emphasized here. In other words, the tendency to perform altruistic behavior

toward others by people at this stage decreases consistently in the following order: kin, good friends, and strangers. This hierarchy of human relationships also reflects an important aspect of primary group altruism.

Moral education should focus on extending the affective relationships with kin and family members to acquaintances and best friends. The widening of the interpersonal relationships to include friends, classmates and neighbors is the major developmental task at this educational level.

Moral Feeling and Psychological Needs: Love and Sense of Belongingness

People at this stage consider the gratification of the basic needs of the primary group members as important when they face a dilemma. When both they themselves and the primary group are in the state of deficiency of basic needs, they tend to regard the interests of the primary group as being as important as theirs, or at least as the next most important.

People at this stage are able to think and feel from the perspective or role of the other. They can put themselves in others' shoes and react empathetically to others' feeling of unhappiness, sadness, pain, distress, discomfort, and loneliness; and therefore have the motivation to help these people. But they exhibit more empathic distress toward lovers, intimates, and closely related people such as siblings and relatives.

The development of love, caring and sense of belongingness to one's primary group is what we should help the children to develop at this stage.

Moral Judgment: Group Conformity and Group Expectations

People at this stage live up to "what is expected by people close to you or what people generally expect of people in your role as son, brother, friend, etc." (Kohlberg, 1976, p. 34). In other words, the right behaviors are those which can earn approval from the group. In short, it is a "good boy-nice girl orientation" (Kohlberg, 1981, p. 18). It is important to try one's best to take care of one's parents so that parents can enjoy their old age.

The understanding of their parents' expectation and the motivation to fulfill these expectations is a challenging educational task at this education level. How to balance one's autonomous choice and one's parents' expected choice is a dilemma that we need to discuss with children at this stage.

Citizenship: Group Identity and Self-Discipline

The development of a clear group identity and the respect of social rules and regulation within the group are essential for building a positive relation between an individual and a group (e.g., the class or school house one belongs to). At Education Level 1, the emphasis is on discipline by authority (e.g., parents and teachers), the emphasis at Educational Level 2 is more on self-discipline — an autonomous, independent and free decision on complying to group rules and regulation.

Education Level 3

Human Relationship and Altruism: Social and Community Relationships

The Norm of Social Altruism applies here and it prescribes people to be altruistic not only to members of their primary group but also to less closely related people in their own society in order to maintain the stability and prosperity of the society (Ma, 1997). In particular, patriotism is emphasized at this stage. People at this stage emphasize loyalty and altruism toward one's country. They are expected to sacrifice their personal needs, benefits and even their basic rights for the sake of the stability and prosperity of the country. Betraying one's nation is not only immoral but also evil and sinful.

The extension of altruism from primary group to other people in the society has been an important topic in Confucianism. For example, in *Liki*, (Classic of Rites), it is stated that "the teaching of respect to one's elder brothers is a preparation for serving all the elders of the country ..." (Lin, 1943, p. 131).

The development of social altruism is a basis of the development of universal love and should be given priority in the moral education of children at this stage.

Moral Feeling and Psychological Needs: Respect for Others and Self-Respect

People at this stage would consider the gratification of basic needs of the majority of the society in their decision to act in a dilemma. They are willing to sacrifice part of their personal interests in order to help those who are deficient of basic needs, in particular deficient of physiological and safety needs.

However, the respect for life is not the same and equal for all people. Those who have high reputation and social status will be valued more than the others. The gratification of esteem needs (Maslow, 1987) is one of the primary concerns at this level.

The teaching of respect (respect for others as well as self-respect) is much emphasized in recent moral character education (Lickona, 1991) and should form the central parts of moral education everywhere.

Moral Judgment: Social Law and Social Norms

People at this stage would regard law as absolutely rational, objective and fair. Law refers to the officiated or institutionalized law. People are protected by law to have legal rights to fair exercise of authority and political rights to a say in the government (Colby & Kohlberg, 1987a, 1987b).

The general expectation of people in a society is to maintain the stability and prosperity of the society. People at this stage would regard anything that contributes to the stability and prosperity of the society as right and good. The majority's opinion and interests precede individual's opinions and interests. The criteria for differentiating right from wrong are based on general consensus, social norms, propriety and traditional rules. People at this stage would live up to what is expected by the majority of people in society. Thus, what is right is what the majority regard as right or what the social norms or traditional rules prescribe.

The Chung-Yung or Golden Mean Orientation in Chinese thought is relevant here. The Golden (Happy) Mean is the halfway between two extremes. It refers to a tendency to behave in a way that the majority of people in the society would behave, or a tendency to behave in a way that the majority would regard as right or proper. Broadly speaking, consensus, propriety, norms, laws or social institutions are formed in a way reflecting the general or average opinion, philosophy, rightness or interests of the majority of people in the society. Thus, consensus, propriety, norms, laws or social institutions could be regarded as representations of the Golden Mean. Whenever conflict arises, Chinese tend to resolve conflicts by a soft, tolerating, compromising and less disturbing attitude. "Reconciliation is precious" is one example of the practice of the Chinese Golden Mean. Such tolerating and compromising attitude would mean that Chinese tend to resolve conflicts outside court or police station, that is, to resolve conflicts in a less officiated or institutionalized way. "Reconcile big conflicts into

small ones, and small ones into none" is the behavior guide of the Chinese at this stage (Ma, 1988).

The emphasis on law-abiding and norm-compliance at this stage of moral education is essential but it is also important to teach children to understand the Chung-Yung (Golden Mean) orientation in Chinese philosophy in resolving moral dilemmas.

Citizenship: Social and National Identity

People at this stage have a need and conscience to care for others, in particular, the old, the very young and the weak in one's country for the sake of maintaining the dignity of life. They have an affective concern for others' welfare and rights. They are willing to help others not because of social exchange and reciprocity but because of a personal willingness or obligation and a deep respect for life. For example, they would rescue a person even by breaking the law not because of the human relationships but because they care for others' life more than many other things. The care for people in one's country and the love of one's country including its history, culture, tradition and values is an important basis of national identity.

The development of national identity and the respect for the social and political institutions is the major focus of education at this stage.

Education Level 4

Human Relationship and Altruism: Humanity and Universal Love

As mentioned before, small-I refers to oneself and Big-I refers to the majority, the social group, society, the country, or the world. The reason for an individual to sacrifice himself/herself for the majority at this stage is based on an affective self-sacrificing altruistic orientation towards the majority. That is, the small-I should be sacrificed to support the Big-I (Chinese proverb). One of the famous ancient Chinese philosophers, Mo Tzu proposed a doctrine of universal love, which states that "men should actually love the members of other families and states in the same way that they love the members of their own family and state, for all are equally the creatures and people of God" (Watson, 1967, p. 9). When asked "what good is such a doctrine", Mo Tzu answered, "it will bring the greatest benefit to the largest number of people" (Watson, 1967, p. 10).

In general, people at this stage are not only altruistic to people in their own country but also altruistic to people in other countries. In other word, "people in the four seas are brothers". Universal love is one of the major themes being promoted at this stage.

The development of humanity and universal love is an ideology in moral education, and to what extent this ideology can be practiced remains as a practical question to be resolved by frontier teachers and educators.

Moral Feeling and Psychological Needs: Self-Actualization

People at this stage decide to help on the basis of the principle of utilitarianism which aims at the greatest happiness of the greatest number. In other words, if there is a conflict of interest between an individual and the majority, the individual should be prepared to sacrifice himself/herself for the majority.

In addition, students at this stage should be helped to self-actualize their potential and become a creative, moral, democratic, and broad-minded person (Maslow, 1987). They should show a deeper identification with human species as a whole. They should also have some mission in life; some tasks that "they must do or want to do". Their missions and tasks are largely concerned with the good of mankind in general. They tend to be more independent of the physical and social environment, that is, more independent of their cultural influences or show a higher degree of autonomy in thought and behavior.

Moral Judgment: Human Rights and Universal Justice

People at this stage act according to self-chosen principles and the emphasis is on the autonomy and freedom in choosing a moral principle, that is, the free will. In short, "a rational agent must regard himself/herself as capable of acting on will as his/her own. That is to say, from a practical point of view every rational agent must presuppose his/her will to be free. Freedom is a necessary presupposition of all action as well as of all thinking" (Paton, 1978, p. 40). That is, these universal ethical principles are not chosen under the external compulsion of consensus, social norms, proprieties, social laws, or majority rights or welfare. These people regard themselves as an end and not a means to any other persons or any other things and thus they are the ones who freely choose the moral laws where they are bound to obey (Paton, 1978, p. 34).

People at this stage act according to their self-chosen ethical principles. They are able to transcend or resolve the moral conflicts between the majority and individual in a just and least disturbing way. The principles chosen are universal ethical principles which are based on good will and are applicable to any person in any situation without exception. There are three principles here: (a) Principle of Respect for Personality: Persons are regarded as ends and not means. They are of unconditional values. (b) Principle of Justice: This principle defines individual justice as "the right of every situation, not just those codified into law" (Kohlberg, 1971, p. 210). (c) Universalistic Principle of Role-taking: This principle guides an actor in a dilemma situation to act and play a role in a way that any rational individual in a similar situation should do. It is argued that decisions governed by this principle are universalistic and reversible.

The emphasis here is autonomy and the development of the universal principles of universal justice. This is the final part of the moral judgment education in university education.

Citizenship: Globalization and World Citizenship

In contrast to the development of national identity in level 3, the emphasis here is to break the boundary between countries and to foster the development of world citizenship at this level of moral education.

According to Cogan (1998), there are five attributes of citizenship. We will try to apply these five attributes in the elaboration of world citizenship here. (1) A sense of identity: Students should be taught not only the concept of national identity and national patriotism but also multinational identity and world citizenship. Not only they belong to their own country but also belong to this world. They should show care and empathy to those disadvantaged people in the less developed places in the world and thus should try to help them as far as possible. (2) Rights and entitlements: People in the world should have the essential basic rights such as right to life, right to seeking happiness, right to freedom of speech, right to properties, etc. (3) Responsibilities, obligations and duties: As a responsible world citizen, one should have the obligations to obey the international law and to respect the rights, traditions, customs of other people in the world. (4) Active in public and international affairs: A good world citizen participates actively in public and international affairs and shows concern and care for the welfare of the people in the world. (5) Acceptance of basic societal values: There are some essential and fairly universal societal values

that everyone should accept. For examples, "trust, cooperation, respect for human rights, non-violence" (Cogan, 1998, p. 5).

The development of genuine world citizenship is a high level of social and moral development and should be the aim of citizenship education.

A summary of the proposed moral education program is presented in Table 1.

Table 1 Moral Development and Moral Education for Primary, Secondary and University Students

Human Relationships & Altruism	Moral Feeling & Psychological Needs
Education Level 1 (kindergarten to junior primary)	
- Egoistic and selfish	- Focus on survival and physical needs
- Deep attachment to parents	- Fear of physically hurt or physically punished
- Education: filial piety & the idea of home – sweet home	- Education: secure attachment and basic trust with family members and significant others
Education Level 2 (senior primary to junior secondary)	
- Primary group altruism	- Able to think and feel from the role of the others
- Hierarchy of human relationship: kin, good friends, and strangers	- Caring of others and development of empathy for friends and acquaintances
- Education: affective relationships with family members and friends, classmates and neighbours	- Education: sense of belongingness
Education Level 3 (senior secondary to post-secondary)	
- Norm of Social Altruism: from primary group to other people	- Concern and caring of the social welfare and basic needs of people in your country
- Education: love people of your Country	- Development of self-respect
	- Education: self-esteem and caring of the needs of general others
Education Level 4 (undergraduate to postgraduate)	
- To be altruistic not only to people in your country but also to people in other countries	- Self-actualization: to be a creative, moral, democratic, and broad-minded person
- "People in the four seas are Brothers"	- To identify with human species as a whole
- Education: to foster the development of universal love	- Education: to learn to be a self-reliant, self-regulated and self-actualized person

Moral Judgment	**Citizenship**

Education Level 1 (kindergarten to junior primary)

- Obey authority's commands
- Rule and regulation: rigid and not changeable
- Instrumental purpose and exchange
- Education: reciprocity, cooperation, mutual helps and mutual respect

- Compliance to group norm
- Discipline and group affiliation
- Education: group rules and discipline within a group

Education Level 2 (senior primary to junior secondary)

- Good boy-nice girl orientation
- Group conformity
- Education: understanding and fulfilment of parents and adult's expectation

- Rights, entitlement and obligations of a citizen
- Social responsibility
- Education: group identity and self-discipline

Education Level 3 (senior secondary to post-secondary)

- Law-abiding and norm-following
- Social order and prosperity
- Golden Mean (Chung-Yung)
- Education: law and order in one's society

- Patriotism: loyal to one's country
- Democracy and social institution
- Education: national identity and respect for social and political institutions

Education Level 4 (undergraduate to postgraduate)

- Basic human rights
- Free will in making moral judgment and decision
- Principle of universal justice
- Education: genuine autonomy and Universal ethical principles and non-violence

- Globalization and world citizenship
- Active participation in international and public affairs
- Universal societal values (e.g., trust, cooperation, respect for human rights
- Education: multinational identity and world citizenship

Moral Character Education

Apart from looking at the structure of moral education from a psychological developmental perspective as mentioned in the last section, there is another possible perspective which focuses on the education for moral characters (DeRoche & Williams, 2001; Lickona, 1991; Nucci & Narvaez, 2008). I would focus on the nature of moral characters in the following discussion and leave other issues such as methods of teaching and the relationships between these moral characters and other psychological aspects (e.g., cognitive, affective and behavioral aspects of moral development) for future explorations. It is argued that there are ten primary moral characters that we need to help the children to develop.

Humanity

Jen or humanity "has something of the love which parents have naturally for their children. It has something of the compassion which a man of sensitivity feels when seeing an innocent animal slaughtered" (Dobson, 1963, p. 27). A great Confucian philosopher, Mencius, also said, "it is a feeling common to all mankind that they cannot bear to see others suffer" (Dobson, 1963, p. 132). The features of *Jen* or humanity include: (1) Everyone has a feeling of distress at the suffering of others. (2) We should love others in the same way we love ourselves. (3) A natural way to help others should cause the least disturbances to all parties concerned.

Moral education should also focus on related characters such as forgiveness (Enright, 1994; Enright & the Human Development Study Group, 1991), empathy (Hoffman, 2000), altruism and universal love (Ma, 1997) and caring (Gilligan, 1982).

Intelligence

The cognitive aspect of moral development is usually expressed in terms of moral reasoning, moral judgment and moral thinking. Damon's (1988) concept of moral awareness, Piaget's (1932) stage of autonomy, Kohlberg's (1981) stage of universal principle of justice and Howard Gardner's concept of interpersonal intelligence (see Woolfolk, 2007, pp. 113–116) are some important perspectives on moral intelligence. As far as information processing is concerned, Rest's (1986) Four Components Model explains the moral judgment and decision process clearly.

Students should be taught to be critical, creative, rational, fair and forgiving in their moral judgment and decision.

Courage

The virtue of courage is regarded as one of the core moral qualities by many philosophies and religions such as Confucianism, Taoism, Christianity and Hinduism (Vessels, 1998). Courage refers to the emotional disposition that would push one to act and move forward in front of great difficulty and serious threat. There are two types of courage: (1) Short-term Courage: It refers to the spontaneous and instantaneous reaction to a moral dilemma or moral challenge. (2) Long-term Courage: It refers to the persistence and perseverance that one upholds to do good and right things in great hardship, poverty, difficulty and threats. The tolerance and torture sometimes may be quite unbearable to common people.

Conscience

Conscience is an intrinsic personal quality that has two major aspects: the cognitive and affective aspects (Lickona, 1991, pp. 57–58). Cognitively, conscience knows what is right and what is wrong, and what one should do and what one shouldn't do. The affective aspect refers to the feeling of shame and guilt when one has done something wrong or when one is not able to do something good or right. The conscience is quite related to the concept of morality defined by psychoanalytic psychologists, that is, one's moral action is motivated by a negative wish to avoid the painful feeling of shame and guilt (Gilligan, 1976).

The development of a genuine conscience has three aspects: (1) Cognitive aspect: an intelligence, sensitivity and awareness that would enable one to differentiate spontaneously and accurately good from bad, true from fake, natural from artificial, constructive from destructive, and positive from negative. (2) Affective aspect: a disposition that motivates one to carry out the action sincerely, peacefully and persistently with pride and usually free from feeling of shame and guilt. (3) Behavioural aspect: a self-regulated behavioural pattern that not only would repeat and sustain old good behaviours and refrain from doing bad behaviours but also would learn and create new good behaviours.

Autonomy

As mentioned before, the concept of autonomy is regarded as the aim of moral education by Bull (1969). At the highest stage of moral development delineated by Kohlberg (1981, 1984) and Ma (1992, 1997, 1998), people act according to self-chosen principles and the emphasis is on the autonomy and freedom in choosing a moral principle, that is the free will. In other words, people at such a high stage are able to transcend or resolve the moral conflicts between the majority and individual in a just and least disturbing way. The principles chosen are universal ethical principles which are based on a good will and are applicable to any person in any situation without exception.

Respect

According to Lickona (1991), respect and responsibility are two major characters that schools should teach. Respect "takes three major forms: respect of oneself, respect for other people, and respect for all forms of life and the environment that sustains them (Lickona, 1991, p. 43). Similarly, Maslow (1987) regarded esteem needs as one of the major basic needs in his hierarchy of basic needs.

Respect of oneself or self-respect refers to one's disposition to cherish one's worth and one's confidence in facing challenges. Respecting oneself also means one should be true and honest to oneself.

Respecting for other people would mean to be polite, tolerant, graceful, dignified, sincere, honest, fair, humble and caring of others' feeling. The Golden Rule for respecting for oneself and for other people is: "Do unto others as you would have them do unto you".

Respecting for all forms of life includes respect for animal rights and the rights of all living things. It also includes a respect and love of Nature and hence will try one's best to protect Nature.

Responsibility

The moral value of responsibility is derived from the value of respect (Lickona, 1991). The value of responsibility is elaborated from four different perspectives.

1. Personal responsibility: One's obligation and responsibility is based on one's self-chosen ethical principles such as Principles of Universal

Justice and Universal Love. Personal responsibility also refers to one's reliability and trustworthiness.

2. Responsibility for Primary Group: The norm of filial piety, parenthood, sibling love and spouse relationship prescribe people to be responsible and accountable for the welfare and protection of their parents, children, siblings, and spouse.

3. Social and Civil Responsibility: It is argued that as a citizen, one has "the obligation to perform certain duties, including the responsibility to obey the law, to pay one's taxes, to respect the rights of other people, to fight for one's country and generally to fulfil one's social obligations" (Cogan, 1998, p. 2).

4. Global responsibility: As a world citizen, one has the responsibility to take care of the welfare of the people in their own countries and also people in other countries. For example, not only one has the responsibility to abide by the law in one's own country but also to obey the international law. One should also respect the rights and traditional values of people in other cultures. In general, one should defend the universal justice for all the people in the world.

Naturalness

According to Ku (2001), Chinese people have a childlike heart and adult intelligence. The spirit of the Chinese people is evergreen with a permanent racial soul. In the description of the characteristics of self-actualizers, Maslow (1987) also argued that self-actualizing people always behave with a high degree of spontaneity, simplicity and naturalness, which are common in young children's behavior. They have also "the wonderful capacity to appreciate again and again, freshly and naïvely, the basic goods of life, with awe, pleasure, wonder and even ecstasy" (Maslow, 1987, p. 136). In short, the virtue of naturalness means purity, simplicity, softness, spontaneity, sincerity and genuineness (Ma, 1990).

Loyalty

The virtue of loyalty is regarded one of the core moral quality in Confucianism (Ku, 2001). To be loyal to a group would mean that one identifies with the value and interests of the group and would stand up to defend the interests of the group when the group is facing crisis or threats at the expenses of one's personal interest.

One should be loyal to one's primary group (e.g., family, political party, religious party) and one's society and country. The identification with and loyal to one's country favours the development of national patriotism (Ma, 2006). Above all, one should be loyal to one's belief and moral principles.

The characteristics of loyalty are related to those of integrity and honesty.

Humility

We should be humble and polite to others. Confucius said "Behave with great respect and prudence when away from home as though you were receiving a distinguished guest. Preside over the common people with gravity and seriousness as though you were officiating at a grand sacrifice. Do not do to others what you would not want others to do to you" (Lao, 1992, p. 193). The virtue of humility demonstrates the soft, peaceful, elegant, graceful and gentle character of a person. A society of humble and polite people will be a society of peace, dignity and happiness.

A summary of the features of the ten primary moral characters is presented in Table 2.

Table 2   A Summary of the Ten Primary Moral Characters

_____

1.   Humanity
   - Everyone has a feeling of distress at the suffering of others.
   - We should love others in the same way we love ourselves.
   - A natural way to help others should cause the least disturbances to all parties concerned.
   - Related moral characters: forgiveness, empathy, altruism, universal love, caring

_____

2.   Intelligence
   - Efficient, spontaneous, creative and autonomous process of moral judgment and decision.
   - Operational Principles: Principle of Utilitarianism and Principles of Universal Justice.
   - Related moral characters: creativity, moral awareness, fairness, rationality

3. Courage
   - Short-term courage: spontaneous and instantaneous reaction to a moral dilemma or moral challenge.
   - Long-term courage: to uphold one's moral principle for a long time when facing great hardship, poverty, difficulty and threats.
   - Related moral characters: perseverance, persistence

   _____

4. Conscience
   - Cognitive aspect: an intelligence, sensitivity and awareness that would enable one to differentiate spontaneously and accurately good from bad, true from fake, natural from artificial, positive from negative, beneficial from damaging, etc.
   - Affective aspect: a disposition that motivates one to carry out the action peacefully and persistently with pride and usually free from feeling of shame and guilt.
   - Behavioural aspect: a self-regulated behavioural pattern that not only would repeat and sustain old good behaviours and refrain from doing bad behaviours but also would learn and create new good behaviours.
   - Related moral characters: sincerity, feeling of shame, feeling of guilt

   _____

5. Autonomy
   - Freedom and independency in choosing a moral principle.
   - People regard themselves as an end and not a means to any other persons or any other things.
   - Related moral characters: free will, independency

   _____

6. Respect
   - Respect of oneself or self-respect refers to one's disposition to cherish one's worth and one's confidence in facing challenges.
   - Respecting for other people would mean to be polite, tolerant, graceful, dignified, sincere, honest, fair, humble and caring of other's feeling. The Golden Rule is: "Do unto others as you would have them do unto you".
   - Respecting for all forms of life includes respect for animal rights and the rights of all living things. It also includes a respect and love of the Nature.
   - Related moral characters: politeness, tolerance, gracefulness, dignity, concern of other's feeling

   _____

7. Responsibility
   - Personal responsibility: One's obligation and responsibility is based on one's self-chosen ethical principles such as Principles of Universal Justice and Universal Love. Personal responsibility also refers to one's reliability and trustworthiness.

- Responsibility for Primary Group: The norm of filial piety, parenthood, sibling love and spouse relationship prescribe people to be responsible and accountable for the welfare and protection of their parents, children, siblings, and spouse.
- Social and Civil Responsibility: "The responsibility to obey the law, to pay one's taxes, to respect the rights of other people, to fight for one's country and generally to fulfil one's social obligations" (Cogan, 1998, p. 2).
- Global responsibility: As a world citizen, one has responsibility to take care of the welfare of the people in their own countries but also people in the other countries.
- Related moral characters: accountability, reliability, trustworthiness

_____

8. Naturalness
    - A childlike heart and adult intelligence.
    - Always behave with a high degree of spontaneity, simplicity and naturalness, which are common in young children's behavior.
    - Related moral characters: purity, simplicity, spontaneity, genuineness and harmony

_____

9. Loyalty
    - To identify with the value and interests of the group and would stand up to defend the interests of the group when the group is facing crisis or threats at the expenses of one's personal interest.
    - One should be loyal to one's primary group (e.g., family, political party, religious party) and one's society and country.
    - Related moral characters: integrity, honesty

_____

10. Humility
    - "Behave with great respect and prudence when away from home as though you were receiving a distinguished guest".
    - A society of humble and polite people will be a society of peace, dignity and happiness.
    - Related moral characters: gentleness, softness, peace, elegance

_____

Conclusive Remarks

An overview of the psychological concepts of morality is given at the beginning of this paper and the aims of moral education based on these concepts are delineated in details. A proposed moral education curriculum is presented in parallel with the moral development of students. Finally a list of ten primary moral characters is suggested for teaching purposes. Education must have a moral aim — an aim that is acceptable to educators, parents and all stakeholders. In addition, the aim should be achievable, practical, morally adequate and logically sound. It is argued that the proposed moral education curriculum and the ten primary moral characters are culturally universal and should be applicable in different cultures.

The proposed Four-Level Moral Education Curriculum Model depicts the milestone developmental aspects that we need to take care of in the construction of the curriculum materials. It is not supposed to be a linear developmental model. For example, senior secondary students or even junior secondary students may have the ability to learn part of the concepts of basic human rights and world citizenship. But the major parts of these concepts are suggested to be taught and explained in details at university level. Since the development of an advanced level of moral thinking and concepts requires a higher level of cognitive development (Kohlberg, 1984; Rest, 1986), it is reasonable that some of the more complicated moral concepts may have to be taught at university level. In other words, it may be argued that there may be some potential bias of elitism embedded in this model, since only about 18% of the secondary school graduates are able to enter the universities in Hong Kong.

The proposed model focuses on predominately positive aspects of moral development. The negative aspect of development and behaviour such as antisocial, aggressive, illegal, and immoral behaviour is another topic for future research. In addition, the diversified social background of the students may be an important issue for the curriculum developers and researchers to consider in their future research work. For example, how the idea of "sweet home" at Education Level 1 — human relationships and altruism component be taught to the students from broken families? Perhaps, some sort of intervention programs may have to be implemented to students of special needs before some sensitive topics be taught to them.

Future research should work out the concrete contents of the proposed moral education curriculum as well as the methods for fostering the development of the ten primary moral characters in children and adolescents.

In addition, cross-cultural studies should be conducted to justify the universal claim of the proposed moral education curriculum and the ten primary moral characters.

References

Adolescent Health Project. (2004). *Teaching package*. Hong Kong: Department of Health, Hong Kong Government. [in Chinese]

Bull, N. J. (1969). *Moral education*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Catalano, R. F., Berglund, M. L., Ryan, J. A. M., Lonczak, H. S., & Hawkins, J. D. (2002). Positive youth development in the United States: Research findings on evaluations of positive youth development programs. *Prevention and Treatment, 5,* Article 15. Retrieved July 31, 2009, from http://www.journals.apa.org/ prevention/ volume5/pre0050015a.html

Cogan, J. J. (1998). Citizenship education for the 21st century: Setting the context. In J. J. Cogan & R. Derricott (Eds.), *Citizenship for the 21st century: An international perspective on education* (pp. 1–20). London: Kogan Page.

Colby, A., & Kohlberg, L. (1987a). Theoretical foundations and research validation. *The measurement of moral judgment* (Vol. I). Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.

Colby, A., & Kohlberg, L. (1987b). Standard issue scoring manual. *The measurement of moral judgment* (Vol. II). Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.

Damon, W. (1988). *The moral child: Nurturing children's natural moral growth.* New York: The Free Press.

Dobson, W. A. C. H. (1963). *Mencius*. London: Oxford University Press.

DeRoche, E. F., & Willaims, M. M. (2001). *Character education: A guide for school administrators*. Kent: Scarecrow Press.

Duncan, A. R. C. (1979). Escapes from moral thinking. In D. B. Cochrane, C. M. Hamm, & A. C. Kazepides (Eds.), *The domain of moral education* (pp. 7–16). New York: Paulist Press.

Durkheim, E. (1925). *Moral education* (E. K. Wilson & H. Schnurer, Trans.). New York: The Free Press.

Education Bureau. (2007). *Ethics and religious studies.* Retrieved July 31, 2009, from http://www.edb.gov.hk/index.aspx?langno=1&nodeid=3328 [In Chinese]

Education Department. (1982–1993). *Moral education reference materials* (Vols. 1–12). Hong Kong: Religious/Ethics Studies Division, Advisory Inspectorate, Education Department, Hong Kong Government. [in Chinese]

Enright, R. D. (1994). Piaget on the moral development of forgiveness: Identity or reciprocity? *Human Development, 37*(2), 63–80.

Enright, R. D., & the Human Development Study Group. (1991). The moral development of forgiveness. In W. M. Kurtines & J. L. Gewirtz (Eds.), *Handbook of moral behavior and development: Vol. 1. Theory* (pp. 123–152). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Eysenck, H. J. (1976). The biology of morality. In T. Lickona (Ed.), *Moral development and behavior: Theory, research, and social issue*s (pp. 108–123). New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Fang, F. X., & Fang, G. (1999). *Education of mental health* (textbook series for pupils)*.* Beijing: Peking Normal University Press. [In Chinese]

Gilligan, C. (1982). *In a different voice*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Gilligan, J. (1976). Beyond morality: Psychoanalytic reflections on shame, guilt, and love. In T. Lickona (Ed.), *Moral development and behavior: Theory, research, and social issues* (pp. 144–158). New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Giroux, H. A. (1983). *Theory and resistance in education: A pedagogy for the opposition*. London: Heinemann Educational Books.

Ho, D. Y. F. (1986). Chinese patterns of socialization: A critical review. In M. H. Bond (Ed.), *The psychology of the Chinese people* (pp. 1–37). Hong Kong: Oxford University Press.

Ho, K. K., & Ho, B. (2004). A review of moral education curriculum materials in Hong Kong. *Journal of Moral Education, 33*(4), 631–636.

Hoffman, M. L. (2000). *Empathy and moral development: Implications for caring and justice.* New York: Cambridge University Press.

Independent Commission Against Corruption. (2005). *ICAC moral education web.* Retrieved July 31, 2009, from: http://www.icac.org.hk/me/ [In Chinese]

Kohlberg, L. (1969). Stage and sequence: The cognitive-developmental approach to socialization. In D. A. Goslin (Ed.), *Handbook of socialization: Theory and research* (pp. 347–480). Chicago: Rand-McNally.

Kohlberg, L. (1971). From is to ought: How to commit the naturalistic fallacy and get away with it in the study of moral development. In T. Mischel (Ed.), *Cognitive development and epistemology* (pp. 151–235). New York: Academic Press.

Kohlberg, L. (1976). Moral stage and moralization: The cognitive-developmental approach. In T. Lickona (Ed.), *Moral development and behavior* (pp. 31–53). New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Kohlberg, L. (1981). *Essays on moral development: Vol. 1. The philosophy of moral development*. San Francisco: Harper & Row.

Kohlberg, L. (1984). *Essays on moral development: Vol. 2. The psychology of moral development*. San Francisco: Harper & Row.

Ku, H. M. (2001). *Spirit of the Chinese people* (Q. T. Wang & S. Q. Sung, Trans.). Guilin, China: Guangxi Normal University Press. (Original work published in 1915.)

Lao, O. (1992). *The Analects of Confucius*. Jinan, China: Shandong Friendship Press.

Lee, C. M. (2004). Changes and challenges for moral education in Taiwan. *Journal of Moral Education, 33*(4), 575–595.

Lee, W. O., & Ho, C. H. (2005). Ideopolitical shifts and changes in moral education policy in China. *Journal of Moral Education, 34*, 413–431.

Lickona, T. (1991). *Education for character: How our schools can teach respect and responsibility*. New York: Bantam Books.

Lin, C. D. (1998) Foreword. In J. Z. Wo (Ed.), *Psychological guidance for primary schools* (textbook series on mental health). Beijing: Sciences Press. [in Chinese]

Lin, Y. T. (1943). *The wisdom of Confucius.* New York: Random House.

Lu, J., & Gao, D. (2004). New directions in moral education curriculum in Chinese primary schools. *Journal of Moral Education, 33,* 495–510.

Ma, H. K. (1982). *A study of moral development with special reference to psychological needs, human relationships and structures of judgment.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of London.

Ma, H. K. (1988). The Chinese perspectives on moral judgment development. *International Journal of Psychology, 23,* 201–227.

Ma, H. K. (1990). The Chinese Taoistic perspective on human development. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations, 14,* 235–249.

Ma, H. K. (1992). The moral judgment development of the Chinese people: A theoretical model. *Philosophica, 49*, 55–82.

Ma, H. K. (1997). The affective and cognitive aspects of moral development of the Chinese people: A seven-stage development theory. *Indigenous Psychological Research in Chinese Societies, 7,* 166–212. [in Chinese]

Ma, H. K. (1998, January). *The Chinese stage structures of moral development: A cross-cultural perspective.* Paper presented at the Symposium on the "Ontogenetic and Historical Development of Morality", University of Bielefeld, Germany.

Ma, H. K. (2003). The relation of moral orientation and moral judgment to prosocial and antisocial behaviour of Chinese adolescents. *International Journal of Psychology, 38,* 101–111.

Ma, H. K. (2006). Moral competence as a positive youth development construct: Conceptual bases and implications for curriculum development. *International Journal of Adolescent Medicine and Health, 18*(3), 371–378.

Ma, H. K., Tam, K. K., & Wong, M. Y. (Eds.). (2001a). *Whole person education and happy growth: Life and moral education programmes for junior primary schools* (Vols. 1–3). Hong Kong: Life and Ethics Education Project, Hong Kong Baptist University. [in Chinese]

Ma, H. K., Tam, K. K., & Wong, M. Y. (Eds.). (2001b). *Whole person education and happy growth: Life and moral education programmes for junior secondary schools* (Vol. 1–3). Hong Kong: Life and Ethics Education Project, Hong Kong Baptist University. [in Chinese]

Maslow, A. H. (1987). *Motivation and personality* (3rd ed.). New York: Harper & Row.

National Institute of Compilation and Translation. (1994). *Civics and morality for junior high schools* (textbook series, 4th ed.)*. Taiwan: National Institute of Compilation and Translation. [in Chinese]

National Institute of Compilation and Translation. (1995). *Civics for high schools* (textbook series, 7th ed.). Taiwan: National Institute of Compilation and Translation. [in Chinese]

Nucci, L. P., & Narvaez, D. (Eds.). (2008). *Handbook of moral and character education.* New York: Routledge.

Paton, H. J. (1978). *The moral laws: Kant's groundwork of the metaphysics of morals.* London: Hutchinson.

Piaget, J. (1932). *The moral judgment of the child* (M. Cabain, Trans.). London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Quality Education Fund. (2007). *Ten life education project.* Hong Kong: Quality Education Fund. Retrieved July 31, 2009, from http://qef.org.hk/eng/main.htm?user/past_function.php [in Chinese]

Rawls, J. (1999). *A theory of justice* (Rev. ed.)*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Rest, J. R. (1986). *Moral development: Advances in research and theory*. New York: Praeger.

Shek, D. T. L., & Ma, H. K. (Series Eds.). (2005–2008). *P.A.T.H.S. to adulthood: A Jockey Club Youth Enhancement Scheme. F. 1 to F.3 curriculum — Teachers' manual and activities manual* (Vols. 1–7). Hong Kong: Social Welfare Practice and Research Centre, The Chinese University of Hong Kong. [in Chinese]

Shek, D. T. L., & Ma, H. K. (2006). Design of a Positive Youth Development Program in Hong Kong. *International Journal of Adolescent Medicine and Health, 18,* 315–327.

Shek, D. T. L., Ma, H. K., & Sun, R. C. F. (Eds.). (2008). *P.A.T.H.S. to adulthood: A Jockey Club Youth Enhancement Scheme. F.3 curriculum — activity handbook* (Vol.3). Hong Kong: Social Welfare Practice and Research Centre, The Chinese University of Hong Kong. [In Chinese]

Understanding the Adolescent Project. (2003). *Users' manual.* Hong Kong: Social Welfare Department, Hong Kong Government. [in Chinese]

Vessels, G. G. (1998). *Character and community development: A school planning and teacher training handbook.* Westport, CN: Praeger.

Watson, B. (1967). *Basic writings of Mo Tzu, Hsun Tzu, and Han Fei Tzu*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Wilson, J. (1967). General introduction. In J. Wilson, N. Williams, & B. Sugarman, *Introduction to moral education* (pp.11–35). Middlesex, England: Penguin.

Wo, J. Z. (Ed.). (1998a). *Psychological guidance for primary schools* (textbook series on mental health). Beijing: Sciences Press. [in Chinese]

Wo, J. Z. (Ed.) (1998b). *Psychological guidance for secondary schools* (textbook series on mental health). Beijing: Sciences Press. [in Chinese]

Woolfolk, A. (2007). *Educational psychology* (10th ed.). Boston: Pearson Education.

Wright, D. (1971). *The psychology of moral behavior.* Middlesex, England: Penguin.

Xu, J. (1984). *Ethics education* (textbook series for secondary school students). Hong Kong: Catholic Centre. [in Chinese]

Zhang, L. F., & Wang, L. (Eds.). (2002). *Psychological health education for junior secondary school students* (textbook series). Guangdong: Guangdong Education Press. [in Chinese]